

Tourism Certification in Africa

Marketing, incentives and monitoring

14 December 2004

A report to The International Ecotourism Society

Dr Anna Spenceley

Research Fellow
Transboundary Protected Areas Research Initiative
University of the Witwatersrand
Private Bag X3, 2050, Wits, South Africa

Tel: +27 (0)72 3115700

Email: anna@ecotourism.org
www.anna.spenceley.co.uk

CONTENTS

1. Overview	3
2. Approach	3
3. African environmental and social tourism certification initiatives	3
3.1 Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa	3
3.2 Heritage Ecotourism Rating Scheme, South Africa	4
3.3 EcoRating scheme, Kenya	5
3.4 CC Africa Ecotourism audit and management system	6
4. International environmental and social tourism certification initiatives operating in Africa	7
4.1 ISO 14001	7
4.2 Green Globe 21	8
4.3 Blue Flag	9
4.4 Green Hotels Association	11
4.5 Centre for Environmentally Responsible Tourism	11
4.6 Greenstop.net	12
5. Tourism quality certification in Africa	12
5.1 South Africa: Tourism Grading Council	12
6. Comparative analysis	13
7. Discussion	16
8. References	17

TABLES

Table 1: Analysis of marketing strategies	14
Table 2: Analysis of incentives	15

1. OVERVIEW

In November 2004 the International Ecotourism Society commissioned a review of tourism certification systems operating in Africa, supported by the Ford Foundation. The aim of the review was not only to identify what initiatives were currently available, but also to analyse their marketing strategies and incentives and incentives to enterprises. This paper provides information about certification systems developed and applied on the continent with regard to their monitoring and evaluation systems, marketing strategies, and the range of incentives offered to enterprises.

A more detailed review of tourism certification schemes will be delivered in January 2005 in complement to this report.

2. APPROACH

Information on tourism certification systems was gathered primarily through the use of internet search engines, journal articles, books on certification, and by direct emails to key stakeholders involved in certification programs.

3. AFRICAN ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL TOURISM CERTIFICATION INITIATIVES

Three certification systems addressing environmental and social issues of tourism were identified that evolved in Africa: Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa, Heritage Ecotourism Rating Scheme (both in South Africa), and the EcoRating Scheme in Kenya. In addition, Conservation Corporation Africa has an internal company audit framework that has been reviewed.

3.1 Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa

3.1.1 Overview

Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa (FTTSA) was launched in 2002 as an independent initiative of IUCN (the World Conservation Union) that aims to encourage equitable and sustainable tourism growth and development in South Africa. FTTSA does this by promoting the concept of Fair Trade in Tourism, and by marketing fair and responsible tourism businesses using the “Fair Trade in Tourism” Trademark.

This Trademark is an independent symbol of fairness in tourism, which is monitored by FTTSA staff to maximise its effectiveness as a marketing tool for all Trademark users (Seif, 2002).

3.1.2 Marketing strategies

Enterprises awarded the FTTSA trademark are showcased on the FTTSA website (www.fairtourismsa.org.za) and on other FTTSA collateral. The FTTSA brand and certified-establishments are also promoted at major trade shows (e.g. ITB, World Travel Market, Indaba), through networking and presentations by FTTSA staff, in print and electronic media, and direct mail. Information regarding FTTSA is also promoted at international conferences on tourism, such as the World Tourism Organization’s 2004 seminar on Tourism in Less Developed Countries in Washington D.C. One of the values of FTTSA’s trademark is that it is an indication of truth in advertising, especially with regards to environmental and social benefits (Seif, 2002).

3.1.3 Incentives for certification

FTTSA state that products awarded the trademark benefit from having an independent “stamp of approval” that shows their customers that the business is seriously committed to Fair Trade in Tourism (Seif, 2002). Specific benefits in addition to the marketing detailed above include (Seif, 2002):

- Being able to use the FTTSA brand and Trademark for marketing purposes.
- Receiving FTTSA promotional material for marketing purposes:
 - Annual Trademark Award Certificate for display at the business site
 - Monthly e-newsletters specifically for Trademark Users
 - Branded materials for display at the business premises
- Being able to establish linkages with like-minded businesses including other FTTSA-certified establishments and tour operators (both domestic and international).
- Improved management and operations, including improved buy-in by staff and community stakeholders
- Being supported by FTTSA:
 - Invitations to specialized workshops and other events
 - Feedback and advice to improve compliance with Trademark criteria
 - Awareness raising workshops for staff
- Knowing that their business is making a positive contribution to the local economy and to transformation in South Africa as a whole.

3.1.4 Monitoring and evaluation

Formally, FTTSA states that it independently quality assure 25% of all Trademark assessments, to ensure that the process is consistent, accurate and fair. They also assess products annually against the trademark criteria and on targets that were agreed on to improve performance. Enterprises not meeting the criteria do not have their rights to use the Trademark renewed (Seif, 2002).

More informally, FTTSA uses comments from tourists, tour operators, competitors and other stakeholders if they encounter service problems, or if they suspect that the FTTSA Trademark criteria are not being met (Seif, 2002).

FTTSA monitors its own performance by collecting monthly M&E information, conducting bi-annual client satisfaction surveys, commissioning independent research and undertaking an annual brand awareness survey at the Tourism Indaba (Pers. com. J. Seif, 2004).

3.2 Heritage Ecotourism Rating Scheme, South Africa

3.2.1 Overview

Qualitour is a private South African company that launched the Heritage Ecotourism Rating Program in 2001. The program is linked with Green Globe (see section 4.2) and is partnered with AJA South Africa, the registered Green Globe auditors for the region. The Heritage program is designed to offer certification to businesses throughout the tourism industry in South Africa based on the International Hotels Environment Initiative, as the company believes that Green Globe is not wholly suitable to South African realities (as it does not work at the community level). However, all enterprises enrolled with the Heritage program automatically receive Green Globe affiliate status, while qualification for Green Globe certification takes longer (Koch et al, 2001).

3.2.2 Marketing strategies

Marketing is undertaken both electronically and through direct mail activities. Potential members are identified through evaluation of industry standards, and where appropriate, they are approached through a series of direct mail, interviews and presentations. Other marketing activities will include exhibitions, presentations, Public Relations activities, strategic alliances and branding opportunities. Currently, Heritage is the official hospitality industry environmental management initiative together with the Federated Hospitality Association of South Africa (FEDHASA). They have a strategic alliance with the Endangered Wildlife Trust (EWT), the Worldwide Fund for Nature (WWF-SA) and recognition from the World Tourism Organization (Pers. com. G. McManus, 2004).

Members of the programme are promoted through two primary means. Firstly, they are promoted on the official Heritage website (www.heritagesa.co.za) and through their quarterly newsletter. They provide a brochure distribution service as well (Pers. com. G. McManus, 2004).

3.2.3 Incentives for certification

The only incentives that members can receive relate to their resource savings through reduced and managed resource use (reportedly around 15% of current accounts in most cases) and the advertising and marketing benefits associated with 'going green' (Pers. com. G. McManus, 2004)

3.2.4 Monitoring and evaluation

The Heritage Programme includes a regular monitoring and evaluation procedure that ensures that properties that have been granted the applicable classification by Heritage, and that they maintain and improve their position over a period of time. Monitoring takes place on a monthly basis through the return by members of resource utilisation statistics and volumes. This allows Heritage to monitor progress towards resource reduction and compliance regularly. From this information, they are able to determine their resource cost per room (for hotels and lodges) and this is then benchmarked against other member establishments to determine the success of the property concerned (Pers. com. G. McManus, 2004).

They also undertake a comprehensive audit of each property every 8 months to determine on-site changes, improvements and areas of decline. This results in a comprehensive report being compiled and the property is then offered the opportunity to rectify and improve where necessary. Each property is provided with a copy of the Heritage Manual, which they can use to implement the various strategies and systems that have been detailed in the publication (this is a commercial manual and therefore not available for review) (Pers. com. G. McManus, 2004).

3.3 EcoRating scheme, Kenya

3.3.1 Overview

The EcoRating scheme is a voluntary initiative spearheaded by the Eco Tourism Society of Kenya (ESOK). The scheme was started in 2002, and aims to promote sustainable tourism by recognising efforts to promote environmental, economic, and socio-cultural values in Kenya. It does this through a systematic approach that verifies tourism organisations' performance against an agreed set of criteria (www.esok.org/Ecorating.htm).

3.3.2 Marketing strategies

ESOK state that their primary motive in starting the scheme was to develop a sustainable product rather than marketing certified products. However, locally they are promoting the certified facilities through a newsletter and other travel publications, while internationally promotion is done through their website. ESOK recently entered into an agreement with Greenstop in the UK to have those certified in Kenya accredited to UK Greenstop and advertised on their website (www.greenstop.net). Each of the certified units is allowed to do their own marketing using the logo (Pers. com. J. Kepher-Gona, 2004)

3.3.3 Incentives for certification

ESOK do not offer any incentives for businesses to join their program. They simply note that businesses have a responsibility towards their environment and the communities in the areas in which they operate. The scheme provides them with an opportunity to gauge their performance and make improvements towards best practices (pers. com. J. Kepher-Gona, 2004).

3.3.4 Monitoring and evaluation

A panel of judges that evaluates applications, which is made up of experts with diverse experiences in tourism. Each one of them is authorized to check on the certified lodges during their travel in the course of duty or while taking holidays. Their approach for ad hoc monitoring is to avoid "stage management" of operations as would be expected to happen in the case of a scheduled monitoring. The applicants are made aware that there would be ad hoc monitoring of performance but they do not know who evaluators will be. They also use other independent people to gather information on certified lodges. Since information about which lodges are certified is public knowledge, there is also 'peer policing.' ESOK welcomes comments and observations from operators in the industry on the performance of certified lodges (pers. com. J. Kepher-Gona, 2004).

3.4 CC Africa Ecotourism audit and management system

3.4.1 Overview

Conservation Corporation Africa (CCAfrica) is an ecotourism company that operates 30 lodges and camps across six African countries: Kenya, Tanzania, Zimbabwe, Botswana, Namibia and South Africa. They have a Green Team, which is a voluntary group committed to improving CCAfrica's performance by identifying priorities, monitoring impacts, identifying actions and solutions to assist in enhanced performance and guiding the initiatives towards sound management. Any staff member can join the Green Team as part of their personal commitment and their inputs, actions, suggestions and advice are greatly appreciated (Pers. com. L. Carlisle, 2004).

CCAfrica has an internal ecotourism audit and management system that addresses resource management, Guest experience; and Community benefits. This is not, however, a certification system – but rather a self-reporting audit process.

3.4.2 Marketing strategies

The audit is marketed internally within the company, rather than being used to externally advertise the performance of each lodge to clients.

3.4.3 Incentives for certification

The system is set up to be self-motivating and not externally enforced. CCAfrica feel that people doing the right thing because they want to is much more sustainable than a policed enforced system, and avoids people ‘spring cleaning’ before visits and ignore the environment when inspections are not due (Pers. com. L. Carlisle, 2004). An award is granted annually for the best performing lodge in the group.

3.4.4 Monitoring and evaluation

To determine current performance the first step is an Ecotourism Audit, which focuses on all the aspects of ecotourism. They then ask five questions in each of the headings with simple yes or no answers and end with a table to help priorities areas that need attention.

The system is set up to be self-motivating and not externally enforced. They feel that people doing the right thing because they want to is much more sustainable than a policed enforced system, and avoids people ‘spring cleaning’ before visits and ignore the environment when inspections are not due (Pers. com. L. Carlisle, 2004).

Les Carlisle of CCAfrica states that the, “system certainly has improved awareness across the lodges with some really flying and others just getting by. Time will tell if this approach will be sustainable or not” (Pers. com. L. Carlisle, 2004).

4. INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL TOURISM CERTIFICATION INITIATIVES OPERATING IN AFRICA

Seven international certification systems addressing environmental and social issues of tourism were identified that were applied in Africa: ISO14001, Green Globe 21, Blue Flag, the Green Hotels Association, the Centre for Environmentally Responsible Tourism and Greenstop.net.

4.1 ISO 14001

4.1.1 Overview

The website of the International Standardization Organization (ISO) states that its standards add value to all types of business operations. They contribute to making the development, manufacturing and supply of products and services more efficient, safer and cleaner. ISO is effectively a network of the national standards institutes of some 140 countries, 32 of which are in Africa. It has a central office in Switzerland, which coordinates the system and publishes the finished standards. All strategic decisions are referred to the ISO members, who meet for an annual General Assembly (www.iso.org).

ISO 14001 is the standard against which an organization may have its Environmental management System (EMS) audited by an independent certification body that then vouches for the conformity of the system to the standard's requirements by issuing an "ISO 14001 certificate". It is a process-based system, and ISO facilitated the development of the EMS rather than doing the audit themselves.

4.1.2 Marketing strategies

The ISO has a website where it markets the different standardisation tools, such as ISO14001. National Standards Institutes in each country are then responsible for marketing and disseminating

information regarding standards nationally. There are 32 member organisations in Africa that will use different strategies in their market. For example, the South African Bureau of Standards (SABS) as the national agency responsible for standardisation including ISO14001 in South Africa.

4.1.3 Incentives for certification

Information regarding the benefits of ISO for business are presented on the ISO website. They State that increasingly organisations need to demonstrate sound business management that includes concern for the environment. They state that there is growing evidence that this results in advantages in financing, insurance, marketing, regulatory, and other areas of operations (ISO, 2002).

4.1.4 Monitoring and evaluation

Certification to ISO standards is based on having an acceptable process for developing and revising the EMS, rather than on the implementation of the EMS. A business can either set up the ISO system themselves, or contract and independent company to audit their EMS. The business decides the scope of the EMS. Once a company is certified to an ISO standard, it receives a certification for three years (Honey and Stewart, 2002).

ISO produces a survey annually regarding the implementation of ISO standards globally. It is understood that this report contains information about the number of "Hotels and restaurants" that are certified.

4.2 Green Globe 21

4.2.1 Overview

The World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC) initiated Green Globe in 1994 in England. The scheme has evolved over the past decade from a process-based framework into one that is more performance-based. Green Globe 21 provides tourism operations with a framework to benchmark their environmental and social performance, achieve certification, and continuously improve their performance. The scheme addresses enterprise policies, the regulatory framework, performance, EMS and stakeholder consultation (Koeman et al, 2001). In Africa there are Green Globe 21 enterprises in Kenya, Egypt and the Seychelles (www.greenglobe21.com).

4.2.2 Marketing strategies

Green Globe 21 has a range of marketing activities. They are currently focussing on forming strategic partnerships and alliances with a range of tourism and environmental organisations through which they promote the principles of sustainable tourism and how Green Globe 21 can help the industry improve its environmental and social performance. Current partners include Caribbean Alliance of Sustainable Tourism, Bali Greenery, West Virginia EPA, China SEPA, and others as listed on their web site (www.greenglobe21.com). Green Globe 21 is also represented at many of the major tourism events worldwide, and last year has attended the World Travel Mart, IMEX PATA and other international travel shows and exhibitions (pers. com. C. Hendrie, 2004).

By encouraging all their operators to promote their Green Globe 21 status they state that they are increasing awareness of the brand throughout the tourism industry. This is achieved through offering of prizes to companies who promote their Green Globe 21 status. They recently held a competition for the company with the best promotion of Green Globe 21, on their website – and the

winner received a premium marketing opportunity through an article in the PATA Compass magazine (pers. com. C. Hendrie, 2004).

Much of the marketing provided for their customers is in allowing them to use of the Green Globe 21 logo and associated marketing material. They encourage their customers to use the logo in all of their promotional material. They also provide all Certified operators with a Case Study of their operation highlighting their environmental achievements and best practice (pers. com. C. Hendrie, 2004).

They have an arrangement with both the PATA Compass magazine and the National Hotel Executive magazine to publish a series of articles focussing on Green Globe customers. Recently the Caribbean Alliance for Sustainable Tourism (CAST) and the Environmental Audits for Sustainable Tourism (EAST) have published brochures promoting Green Globe Certified businesses. The Rainforest Alliance is also preparing a publication of a catalogue that includes the certified operations for the Network together with a description of the certifying programs (pers. com. C. Hendrie, 2004).

4.2.3 Incentives for certification

The incentive for operators to join Green Globe 21 comes primarily through the cost savings associated with a systematic approach to environmental management. This includes savings in water consumption, solid waste disposal, electricity consumption and resource conservation. The Green Globe 21 system provides businesses with a mechanism to measure ongoing improvements from year to year and provides a basis for triple bottom line reporting (pers. com. C. Hendrie, 2004).

Green Globe 21 indicate that another major incentive for operators to join the program over other such programs is that they are a “globally recognised brand and currently offer the only worldwide environmental program especially for the travel and tourism industry and tourist destinations”. Green Globe 21 state that this increases companies' marketing potential (pers. com. C. Hendrie, 2004).

4.2.4 Monitoring and evaluation

Currently participants undertaking the Green Globe 21 program go through a process of first Benchmarking and then Certification. Benchmarking involves participating operations collecting a range of data that measures their environmental and social performance. This includes potable water consumption, energy efficiency, solid waste production, resource conservation and number of locally employed staff. This data is then assessed against Baseline and Best Practice figures that are determined by the operation's sector and location. The Benchmarking program is underpinned by research undertaken by Sustainable Tourism Cooperative Research Centre, consisting of 17 universities across Australia. Once the operation has passed Benchmarking they may proceed to Certification. This involves an onsite inspection by a qualified independent Green Globe 21 assessor (pers. com. C. Hendrie, 2004).

4.3 Blue Flag

4.3.1 Overview

Blue Flag was presented to the European Commission by the Foundation for Environmental Education in Europe (FEEE) in 1987. The FEEE is a not for profit NGO of member organisations

from 35 countries in Europe, Africa and America. The commission launched the initiative as one of several activities during the 'European Year of the Environment' that year. Blue Flag now operates a beach certification system in 25 countries, including South Africa. The award of a South African Blue Flag beach is based on compliance with 14 criteria covering water quality, environmental education and information, environmental management and safety and services. Blue Flags are awarded one season at a time, and if any of the imperative criteria are not fulfilled during the season or the conditions change, the Blue Flag is withdrawn (www.blueflag.org).

4.3.2 Marketing strategies

Blue flag markets its beaches on its website and they undertake various promotions during the year trying to capitalise on high profile opportunities. For example, periodically Blue Flag (pers. com A. Kelly, 2004):

- advertise on illuminated billboards at major airports,
- produce between 40 000 - 60 000 flyers which are distributed through tourism outlets throughout South Africa,
- take out paid advertising in in-house magazines in the hospitality/tourism sector,
- have regular articles are printed in numerous outdoor magazines (e.g. Getaway magazine);
- promotions by authorities and local beaches themselves local media; and
- national workshops with high levels of coverage on radio, TV and print media.

Blue flag indicate the promotions by the beaches and local authorities themselves, are the most important (pers. com A. Kelly, 2004). All certified beaches have noticeboards that inform the public that they are visiting a Blue Flag beach, and are informed what this means. Promotional items such as flags and A- placed onto the sand are used to highlight the Blue Flag status (pers. com A. Kelly, 2004).

4.3.3 Incentives for certification

Blue Flag indicate that the benefits for local authorities participating in the campaign are varied and include conservation, tourism promotion and education. Direct benefits of the Blue Flag campaign in South Africa include (Kelly, 2004):

- safer beaches with lower levels of crime, vandalism and better crowd control;
- clean bathing water;
- access for the disabled;
- tourism promotion, with positive feedback from tourists
- less pollution and litter;
- top quality beach facilities;
- improved environmental management;
- easier beach management;
- opportunity to tap into other proactive coastal initiatives;
- standardisation of national facilities countrywide; and
- financial spin-offs for city, town or beach, e.g. increase in property values and better business for local traders

4.3.4 Monitoring and evaluation

No formal monitoring and evaluation at this stage, and most information collected is anecdotal (pers. com A. Kelly, 2004). Although reports indicate that local authorities who are implementing

Blue Flag on some of their beaches, are still using the same framework to manage other, 'non-Blue Flag' beaches in their area (Kelly, 2004).

4.4 Green Hotels Association

4.4.1 Overview

Member hotels are not 'certified' as such, but make their own determination about what environmental path they take. The Association requires that hotel management are committed to saving water, saving energy and reducing solid waste (pers. com. P. Griffin, 2004). They have one hotel within the association in Africa, located in Egypt.

4.4.2 Marketing strategies

Enterprises are marketed on their website (www.greenhotels.com).

4.4.3 Incentives

Members are given a manual entitled 'Guidelines & Ideas' and a bi-monthly newsletter on how to 'green' their enterprises. The Association guarantees that members will save more than the membership costs by using the ideas they provide (pers. com. P. Griffin, 2004).

4.4.4 Monitoring and evaluation

No information was obtained on the Green Hotels Association's monitoring and evaluation systems.

4.5 Centre for Environmentally Responsible Tourism

4.5.1 Overview

The Centre for Environmentally Responsible Tourism (CERT) was established in 1994 as an independent, voluntary and non-profit-making organisation, to demonstrate how responsible tourism can protect the environment, wildlife and cultural aspects of holiday destinations. CERT's aim is to show how travellers can play a part in protecting the world's natural resources and develop a sustainable future for destinations and the travel industry (www.c-e-r-t.org).

Companies recognised by C.E.R.T. as Environmentally Responsible, are urged to follow stringent environmental guidelines before they are allowed to incorporate the C.E.R.T. logo in their literature and marketing activities. Inclusion of the C.E.R.T logo demonstrates enterprises' commitment to integrating environmental issues into their office environment, their business planning, and by making a financial contribution to conservation projects (www.c-e-r-t.org).

In Africa they have CERT products in Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland and Botswana.

4.5.2 Marketing strategies

CERT-recognised tour operators market CERT products themselves.

4.5.3 Incentives for certification

No information was received from CERT on incentives for certification.

4.5.4 Monitoring and evaluation

No information was received from CERT on their monitoring and evaluation systems.

4.6 Greenstop.net

4.6.1 Overview

Greenstop operates a website with a 'Greenstop Destinations Directory'. Tourists can use the directory to identify hotels, conference venues, holiday and travel companies that are making an effort to work in an environmentally responsible manner (www.greenstop.net).

Greenstop operates worldwide, but has certified enterprises in Kenya (see information in section 3.3 on ESOK), Morocco, Tanzania and Zimbabwe.

4.6.2 Marketing strategies

Enterprises are marketed through Greenstop's website on www.greenstop.net

4.6.3 Incentives for certification

No information was received from Greenstop on incentives for certification.

4.6.4 Monitoring and evaluation

No information was received from Greenstop on their monitoring and evaluation systems.

5. TOURISM QUALITY CERTIFICATION IN AFRICA

5.1 South Africa: Tourism Grading Council

5.1.1 Overview

The Tourism Grading Council of South Africa (TGCSA) was set up in the late 1990s among government officials, major stakeholders in the hospitality sector and organised labour (Koch et al, 2002). Research by the TGCSA indicates that to a consumer "stars" mean quality, and provide information that they can make a "value for money" judgement regarding where they want to stay. The national "star" grading scheme developed for South Africa. The objective of the scheme is to assist in the improvement in the overall quality of accommodation and services in South Africa, rather than to police or impose strict and inflexible guidelines on grading (www.tourismgrading.co.za).

5.1.2 Marketing strategies

The TGCSA sends newsletters to properties every quarter. They do roadshows throughout the country that target stakeholders in the tourism industry, and their assessors who visit non-graded properties and market the whole scheme as they work (pers. com. S. Ndebele, 2004).

Graded properties are marketed by listing them on the South African Tourism (SA Tourism) website (www.southafrica.net). SA Tourism is the government department responsible for marketing South Africa internationally. Properties are also listed in a TGCSA Accommodation

Guide, which is the only accommodation guide distributed by SA Tourism internationally and locally. The guide is also sold throughout bookshops in South Africa (pers. com. S. Ndebele, 2004).

5.1.3 Incentives for certification

No incentives are offered for establishments to be graded, although they are encouraged to benefit from grading through the benefits that become available to them subsequently (pers. com. S. Ndebele, 2004).

5.1.4 Monitoring and evaluation

The Tourism Grading Council of South Africa has a consumer feedback mechanism where consumers let us know about their stay at graded properties. Consumers can either call in into our call centre, through their web address (www.tourismgrading.co.za), or by completing a questionnaire that is available at all graded establishments. This information is analysed by the TGCSA so that they can use the qualitative information. TGCSA accredited assessors implement the enterprise assessments with regard to criteria developed for different types of tourism enterprise (pers. com. S. Ndebele, 2004).

6. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

An overview of the marketing strategies used by the certification systems discussed in this report is presented in Table 1. The data in the table is based on open-ended questions to the certification schemes and information offered by the schemes. All of the schemes allow certified enterprises to use a specific logo in their marketing, and combinations of physical media (i.e. adverts, editorials, notice boards, brochures, newsletters, direct mail, inclusion in guidebooks) are employed to market the logo and certified products. Most of the schemes include some form of networking to market the logo (i.e. trade shows, conferences, and strategic partnerships) and used electronic media as a tool (i.e. websites).

Table 1: Analysis of marketing strategies										
Marketing strategy	African Social and Environmental schemes			International Social and Environmental schemes operating in Africa						Quality scheme in Africa
	Fair Trade in Tourism SA	Heritage	Ecotourism Society of Kenya	ISO 14001	Green Globe 21	Blue Flag	Green Hotels Assoc.	Centre for Env. Resp. Tourism	Greenstop.net	Tourism Grading Council of SA
Use of logo	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Adverts (hospitality/ travel / outdoor magazines)	*		*			*				
Editorials	*				*	*				
Newspapers	*					*				
Brochures/flyers	*	*	*		*	*				
Notice boards / billboards	*					*				
Newsletter	*	*	*							*
Direct mail, presentations & interviews	*	*								
Guidebook										*
Networking										
Strategic partnerships		*	*	*	*					
Trade shows	*	*			*					*
Exhibitions		*								
Conferences	*				*					
Electronic media										
Website	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Radio	*					*				
TV						*				

Table 2: Analysis of incentives										
Incentive or benefit	African Social and Environmental schemes			International Social and Environmental schemes operating in Africa						Quality scheme in Africa
	Fair Trade in Tourism SA	Heritage	Ecotourism Society of Kenya	ISO 14001	Green Globe 21	Blue Flag	Green Hotels Assoc.	CERT	Greenstop.net	Tourism Grading Council of SA
Financial										
Use of Trademark/ brand	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Receive promotional material	*									
Cost savings		*	*	*	*	*	*			
Advertising benefits	*	*	*	*	*			*		*
Better local business environment						*				
Better quality product for tourists	*					*				
Discounts with other institutions			*							
Easier management				*		*				
Prize for best use of logo on web					*					
Branding opportunities					*					
Social										
Networking	*									
Access to information	*	*	*		*		*			
Training	*		*							
Feel-good factor	*		*							
Less crime						*				
Disabled access						*				
Environmental										
Improved environment			*	*		*		*		
Governance										
Regulatory benefits				*						
Insurance benefits				*						

Table 2 provides a comparison of the incentives offered by the certification systems operating in Africa. All of the systems allow enterprises to use their trademark or logo once certified. Financial incentives are diverse, but the majority emphasise the cost savings that enterprises make if they use their particular certification system. Providing access to information and training were offered to many certified products, in addition to the less tenuous ‘feel-good factor’ that ensues from being recognised as environmentally or social responsible.

7. DISCUSSION

This review of certification systems in Africa identified only three commercial systems that addressed responsible tourism that had been developed within the continent. These are Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa (FTTSA), the Heritage Ecotourism Rating Scheme, and the Ecotourism Society of Kenya’s EcoRating Scheme. In addition, seven international certification systems – developed outside Africa – are currently applied in various forms. These were ISO14001, Green Globe 21, Blue Flag, Green Hotels Association, the Centre for Environmentally Responsible Tourism and Greenstop.net. One tourism quality scheme was identified in South Africa, operated by the Tourism Grading Council.

The schemes all allow certified products to use their specific logo, which they consider to be an incentive for certification due to the potential marketing benefits they offer. The schemes used combinations of physical and electronic media to market the logo and certified products, while also using networking opportunities to disseminate information. The schemes claim to provide a variety of financial, social, environmental and institutional incentives for certified products. However, to confirm this, it would be beneficial to contact certified products and determine from them what benefits they perceived from the scheme, and how they viewed the marketing of their logo, and to evaluate the level of awareness of these logos among consumers.

A constraint within this report was the lack of detailed information obtained on the certification systems of either Greenstop.net, the Green Hotels Association or the Centre for Responsible Tourism by the submission deadline. It is anticipated that more information will be forthcoming in the

8. REFERENCES

Honey, M. and Stewart, E. (2002) The evolution of ‘green’ standards for tourism, In Honey, M. (ed) *Ecotourism and certification: setting standards in Practice*, Island Press, pp33-71

Kelly, A. (2004) Benefits of participating in the Blue Flag campaign, from A. Kelly, Blue Flag

Koch, E., Massyn, P.J. and Spenceley, A. (2002) Getting started: The Experiences of South Africa and Kenya, In Honey, M. (ed) *Ecotourism & Certification: Setting Standards in Practice*, Island Press, pp237-263

Koeman, A., Worboys, G., de Lacy, T., Scott, A., and Lipman, G. (2002) Green Globe: A Glocal environmental certification program for travel and tourism, In Honey, M. (ed) *Ecotourism and certification: setting standards in Practice*, Island Press, pp299-324

ISO (2002) Business Benefits of ISO14001, downloaded from <http://www.iso.org/iso/en/prods-services/otherpubs/iso14000/index.html> 26 November 2004

Seif, J. (2002) *Trademark Users' Guide*, Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa, IUCN

Personal communications

Blue Flag	Alison Kelly, National Blue Flag Coordinator, South Africa
Fair Trade in Tourism South Africa	Jennifer Seif, National coordinator
Tourism Grading Council of South Africa	Senzeni Ndebele, Marketing & Communications Manager
Green Hotels Association	Patty Griffin, Green Hotels Association
Green Globe	Claire Hendrie, Customer Services Manager
Qualitour	Greg McManus, Director
Conservation Corporation Africa	Les Carlisle
Ecotourism Society of Kenya	Judy Kepher-Gona
ISO	Gisela Helberling, Assistant, Director Marketing and Promotion